## Performance Audit

## Negotiation of Consultant Contracts

## Michigan Department of Transportation (MDOT)

Report Number:<br>591-0211-20

## Released:

March 2022


#### Abstract

MDOT uses a qualifications-based selection (QBS) process for procuring consultants for services such as engineering and architectural design. Using QBS, MDOT selects a consultant after a comprehensive evaluation of qualifications, such as knowledge, skill, experience, and other project-specific factors, rather than focusing on cost. After selecting the most qualified consultant, MDOT negotiates a fair and reasonable cost for the agreedupon scope of services based on its independent cost estimates. MDOT negotiated 2,047 consultant contracts totaling $\$ 1.35$ billion between October 1, 2017 and May 15, 2020.


| Audit Objective |  |  | Conclusion |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |$|$| Objective: To assess the sufficiency of MDOT's negotiation efforts when procuring <br> consultant contracts. | Sufficient, with <br> exceptions |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| Findings Related to This Audit Objective | Material <br> Condition | Reportable <br> Condition |
| Preliminary <br> Response |  |  |
| Consultants' final priced proposals and contract awards <br> exceeded MDOT's estimated hours and/ or costs by 10\% <br> or more in 42\% of our sampled consultant contracts. <br> Variances between consultants' proposals and contract <br> awards and MDOT's estimated hours and costs <br> indicated MDOT's estimates were not always reliable <br> and did not serve as the basis for negotiation. In <br> addition, MDOT's estimates did not include sufficient <br> information to demonstrate MDOT had conformed with <br> federal regulations by considering all required cost <br> components (Finding 1). |  | X |

Obtain Audit Reports
Online: audgen.michigan.gov
Phone: (517) 334-8050

Office of the Auditor General 201 N. Washington Square, Sixth Floor Lansing, Michigan 48913

Doug A. Ringler, CPA, CIA
Auditor General
Laura J. Hirst, CPA
Deputy Auditor General

