



STATE OF MICHIGAN
JOCELYN BENSON, SECRETARY OF STATE
DEPARTMENT OF STATE
LANSING

April 6, 2020

Richard Lowe, Director
Office of Internal Audit Services
George W. Romney Building
111 South Capitol Avenue, 8th Floor
Lansing, MI 48933

Dear Mr. Lowe:

In accordance with the State of Michigan Financial Management Guide, Part VII, and Part 2, Section 229 of P.A. 56 of 2019, attached is a summary table identifying our responses and corrective action plans to address recommendations contained within the Office of the Auditor General's audit report of the Michigan Department of State, Bureau of Elections, covering the period October 1, 2016 through April 30, 2019.

Questions regarding the summary table or corrective action plans should be directed to me at (517) 241-1385.

Sincerely,

Signature Redacted

Gena Hyde, Director
Information Security and Control Division
Michigan Department of State

Enclosures

c: Honorable Gretchen Whitmer, Executive Office
Honorable Jocelyn Benson, Secretary of State
Doug Ringler, CPA, CIA, Auditor General
Chris Kolb, State Budget Director
Melissa Smiley, MDOS, Chief of Staff
Mike Brady, MDOS, Chief Legal Director
Jonathan Brater, State Bureau Administrator
Adam Reames, MDOS, Legislative Policy Director
Senator Jim Stamas, Chair, Senate Appropriations
Representative Shane Hernandez, Chair, House Appropriations
Christopher Harkins, Director, Senate Fiscal Agency
Mary Ann Cleary, Director, House Fiscal Agency

Michigan Department of State
Performance Audit of the Bureau of Elections
Summary of Agency Responses to Recommendations
October 1, 2016 through April 30, 2019

The Auditor had four recommendations for the Bureau of Elections:

1. Audit Recommendations the agency complied with:
None - in progress
2. Audit Recommendations the agency agrees with and will comply:
 - a. Will comply:
Recommendation Number 1, 2, 3, and 4.
 - b. Will partially comply:
N/A
3. Audit Recommendations the agency disagrees with:
None

**Michigan Department of State
Performance Audit of the Bureau of Elections
Agency Final Responses
October 1, 2016 through April 30, 2019**

RECOMMENDATION #1

Control procedures needed over QVF.

ANTICIPATED ACTION: Will Comply

DESCRIPTION OF ANTICIPATED ACTION:

- *A. Planned:* BOE is finalizing the first quarter comparison of the Driver License File (DLF) and the Qualified Voter File (QVF) in 2020. BOE will document the work performed in completing this quarterly record comparison. BOE will verify that the residential address within the DLF and QVF represent the same physical location, but BOE cannot ensure the address fields are identical because each database uses different address formats. Target date: April 2020
- *B. Planned:* BOE to develop a plan to confirm mismatch information (individual recorded as having voted twice, age listed at 122 years old or higher) contained within QVF. Target date: June 2020

Anticipated Compliance Date: June 2020

RECOMMENDATION #2

Improvement of access controls over QVF Refresh needed.

ANTICIPATED ACTION: Will Comply

DESCRIPTION OF ANTICIPATED ACTION:

- A. (1) *Completed:* The QVF software was updated to automatically disable user accounts after 60 days of inactivity.

A. (2) *Completed:* DTMB implemented a review of their users in the QVF system and notified the QVF information system owner of any employee departures or transfers within 24 hours.

A. (3) *Planned:* In January 2020, BOE notified the clerk community of the need to log into QVF every 60 days. BOE is developing a new procedure and software enhancement to assist the Clerk community to review the QVF users within QVF. Target date: July 2020
- B. *Planned:* BOE requested a software enhancement to create an addition user role within QVF Refresh. New access forms will be completed by the necessary staff and submitted to the QVF User Administrator once the enhancement has been implemented. Target Date: June 2020
- C. *Completed:* BOE updated the access control form and obtained a valid signed and dated access control form consistent with the access that is granted within the system.
- D. *Completed:* The software has been changed so that password configurations are consistent within the application.

Anticipated Compliance Date: July 2020

RECOMMENDATION #3

Improvements needed to training notification process.

ANTICIPATED ACTION: Will comply

DESCRIPTION OF ANTICIPATED ACTION:

Completed: BOE created a video to help Clerks check to see if they were missing any required training.

Planned: BOE is making changes to eLearning to assist Clerks with easily identifying which classes are required to become accredited. Target date: April 2020

Planned: BOE is developing a method to share the completion status of Clerk training on an ongoing basis. Target date: April 2020

Anticipated Compliance Date: April 2020

RECOMMENDATION #4

Statement, report, and complaint review needs improvement.

ANTICIPATED ACTION: Will comply

DESCRIPTION OF ANTICIPATED ACTION:

- Campaign Statements:

Completed: BOE developed a process to run a query of the submitted campaign statements and to notify committees of their failure to file within four business days. As part of this process, the manager verifies staff completed the reviews and sent the appropriate letters.

Planned: To meet the four-day timeline on errors or omissions in filed reports, BOE needs to hire additional staffing or change in the law. Target date: October 2020

- Lobby Reports:

Completed: BOE developed a process to run a query and notify lobbyist and lobbyist agents of their failure to file within ten business days. As part of this process, the manager verifies staff completed the reviews and sent the appropriate letters.

Planned: To meet the ten-day timeline on errors or omissions in filed reports, BOE needs to reallocate existing staff or change in the law. Target date: August 2020

- Campaign Finance Complaints:

Completed: BOE developed a tracking system to ensure compliance with the statutory deadlines. A manager monitors the status of the complaints within 5 business days, and resolution within 135 business days.

Anticipated Compliance Date: October 2020